

Evelyn and Joseph Chiarito
90 Craig Lane, Dover Plains, NY 12522
845-877-6498
echiarito@aol.com

August 1, 2011

Mr. Stephen M. Tomasik, Project Manager
NYS Department of Environmental Conservation
Division of Environmental Permits
625 Broadway – 4th Floor
Albany, New York 12233-1750
Fax: 518.402.9168 - Email: depprmt@gw.dec.state.ny.us

RE: **Cricket Valley Energy DEIS comments**
Cricket Valley Energy Proposal located at Route 22, Town of Dover, Wingdale, NY

Dear Mr. Tomasik:

My husband and I are home owners and taxpayers in the Town of Dover and submit comments below on the proposed Cricket Valley 1,000 MW electric generating facility to be located at the old Mica Plant campus.

While the folks at Cricket Valley Energy have been extremely pleasant and likeable, I am submitting the following comments and concerns which need to be addressed and considered as this project will have a huge impact in many areas on our community.

The 1999 Chazen Companies study of the Harlem Valley aquifer indicates that the Harlem Valley towns from Amenia to Patterson all share the same aquifer, which provides water for 20,000 people. Draw-down on this aquifer by the Dover Knolls complex (1,376 units), other recently approved and proposed housing developments, existing homeowners, adjacent Dover High school, Wingdale Elementary and Dover Elementary schools, and Cricket Valley Energy (all high volume water users) should be evaluated. It is all the same aquifer.

Also, what will be the effect on the adjacent Great Swamp (DP-22) and its sensitive habitats and ecological preserves, such as the Mostachetti-Slocum Preserve and Carruth Preserves held by the Oblong Land Conservancy as well as Nature Conservancy Nellie Hill Preserve and Perry Preserve? Some method of monitoring aquifer depletion should be put in place and maintained by the applicant.

It would be distinctly unfair to put an economically deprived community at risk where local government might have to come up with monies to remedy the lack of water suffered by homeowners and public services. The DEIS should evaluate the cumulative impact on regional groundwater.

The old Mica Plant site which will house Cricket Valley and now houses Rasco Materials (a petroleum contaminated soil processor with **not** a good track record), has a troubling past history. It has been reported that glue was disposed of in deep injection wells on this site in its prior manufacturing days. The possibility of

Page 1 of 3

aquifer contamination is a very serious issue. I realize that Cricket Valley will clean up the site but am wondering if aquifer draw-down can also cause the deep well contamination to be drawn up into the water supply?

The American Lung Association of New York State rates our air quality in Dutchess Co. as an "F." I am not an air quality expert nor do I understand the Cricket Valley modeling explanation. But, I am **astounded** that our air quality comparison is from the Poughkeepsie (airport) area. In our very narrow valley, we have numerous quarrying (blasting) and mining operations with unknown emissions from their operations, related heavy trucking, processing machinery, and Rasco Materials,(a petroleum contaminated soil processor), all of which affect our air quality. Cricket Valley construction, commuting construction crews, trucks and equipment will add to existing air pollution.

Yes, gas is "clean-er" than oil but a gas power plant still pumps out millions of tons of CO₂, smog producing chemicals, and toxins directly into the air we breathe and will increase the already high pollution in our small narrow valley. **None of these cumulative air emissions have ever been evaluated** but we are proposing adding more without any reliable benchmark. It seems to me that we should know what we have before we project what we may/will have. It reminds me of what has happened in poor communities in the Bronx and New York City and the resulting health problems and high asthmatic rates among the children of those communities. Our narrow Harlem Valley is subject to frequent air inversions, a fact which local hang-gliders have also long reported and which any person living here can attest to and clearly see for themselves.

Air quality monitoring equipment should be installed at the Dover High School for a sufficient period of time to provide a reliable air quality benchmark to avoid putting our children at higher risk for lung and other poor air-quality related diseases as well as to comply with all state and federal requirements.

Because air quality is such an important and serious health impacting issue, the Dover Town Board must hire an independent air quality specialist expert to review and evaluate the DEIS and make recommendations. However, the Town of Dover is a poor community without extra monies to spend on experts, (likely one of the reasons that Dover was chosen for this project), I request that Cricket Valley fund this expense. We seem to be a targeted community!

Any proposed host benefit package or money donations is an unfair exchange for the health of our children.

We need to be sure that our small rural fire company is equipped to handle accidents. We recall the huge explosion and tragedy at the Middletown, Ct. gas fired power plant. Safety is critical especially since the facility is close to the Dover High School and Wingdale Elementary school and residential communities, as well as Con Ed transmission lines and the Iroquois gas transmission line. How will Cricket Valley be prepared to handle such a situation?

Noise is already an issue. At the last Town Board meeting, folks living on adjacent Chipewalla Rd. complain that they constantly hear the back-up beeps from Rasco Materials on the same site, and are greatly concerned

about the noise they will have from Cricket Valley both from construction and when operational. It appears Cricket Valley will exceed the noise ordinance. After all, this is a narrow valley where noise carries and echoes from the surrounding hills. Those who live here know that.

Mr. Herzog, former Director of the Energy Office of the City of New York covers noise in detail as well as questioning the need for this plant. I agree with his comments.

Page 2 of 3

I have been told that gas for this project will come from fracking. After reading about the environmental damage from fracking, and seeing the documentary "Gasland," I cannot morally support fracking which has left communities in upstate NY and nearby Pennsylvania areas with contaminated water and without a way to survive in their communities. It is unconscionable. Some of the situations are heartbreaking so I cannot condone such an unethical, heartless method of obtaining fuel, especially if it is not really needed as NYS Independent Service Operator finds.

Cricket Valley will not provide power for this community or more inexpensive power anywhere else. It may also receive so many tax breaks that it will not bring many economic benefits to Dover but big benefit to the developer. Any community benefit may also be offset by the need for emergency and fire services, road maintenance all funded by the taxpayer as well as increased air pollution, community health issues, decreased water availability and/or contaminated aquifer.

I would like to see addressed how this project is being funded. Is it being constructed to take advantage of Federal, State, brownfield, IDA, grant, subsidy, monies (all taxpayer monies)?

Thank you for the opportunity to submit comments.

Respectfully Submitted,

Evelyn Chiarito and Joseph Chiarito

